

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF
THE OHIO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION**

March 13, 2014

Rhodes Office Tower Lobby Hearing Room

Columbus, Ohio

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Hubert called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Commissioners Present:

Chairman Leonard Hubert
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado
Commissioner Tom Roberts
Commissioner William W. Patmon, III
Commissioner Lori Barreras

A quorum was present.

OCRC Staff Present:

G. Michael Payton, Executive Director; Keith McNeil, Regional Counsel/Director of Operations; Stephanie Bostos Demers, Chief Legal Counsel; Desmon Martin, Director of Enforcement and Compliance; Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director; Norman Gibson, Dayton Regional Director; Darlene Newbern, Toledo Regional Director Vera Boggs, Cleveland/Akron Regional Director; Ronnell Tomlinson, Director of Housing/Alternative Dispute Resolution; Courtney Calhoun, Reconsideration Supervisor; Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor; Lori Anthony, Chief, Civil Rights Section – Ohio Attorney General’s Office; and Sandra Aukeman, Administrative Assistant.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to approve the February 20, 2014 minutes. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Mercado	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES

Motion carried.

CONFIRMATION OF STAFF FINDINGS

1. **Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Probable Cause Finding and Grant for Further Review**

Diane C. Helmick v. University of Dayton
DAY76(23790)08062013
22A-2013-03143C

Charles Williams v. Advance Pierre Foods, Inc.
DAYA6(23981)10302013
22A-2014-00558C

2. **Complainant's Request for Reconsideration – Vacate Original No Jurisdiction Finding and Grant for Further Review**

Selina Renee Miller v. Town and Country License Agency, Inc.
COLB1(40564)09252013
22A-2014-00143C

Fred and Ruth Quigley v. Macedonia Property Management, LLC, Coblentz Homes, Inc.,
Joseph Migliorini, Chris Coblentz, and Linda Carruci
AKRH3(36858)04192013
22A-2013-02003F

3. **Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review**

Lloyd Clark v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services*
COL71(40191)04102013
22A-2013-02200C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Willie Mathis v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services*
COL71(40192)04102013
22A-2013-02009C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Matthew C. Engelman v. IAC Huron, LLC
CLEB4(42125)08122013
22A-2013-03048C

Laura L. Middleton v. The Home Depot
DAYA6(23536)04022013
22A-2013-01937C

Respondent's Request for Reconsideration – Grant for Further Review - continued

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Michael H. Moler, Jr., Owner
DAYH6(23620)05162013
22A-2013-02326F

4. Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. Windham Housing Corporation, dba George Nichols Woods Apartments, Alpha Phi Alpha Homes and Nancy Scofield
AKRH3(35245)07302010
05-11-1582-8
22A-2011-00299F
Complaint No. 11-HOU-AKR-35245

Michael and Terri Smith v. Robert and Shelly Lorus and RLSL LLC
AKRH3(36350)04202012
05-12-0798-8
22A-2012-01901F
Complaint No. 13-HOU-AKR-36350

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. K & G Management
AKRH3(38731)07272011
05-10-0637-8
22A-2011-03343F
Complaint No. 12-HOU-AKR-38731

Fair Housing Resource Center v. Christopher Zoller
CLEH4(40113)01292010
05-10-0637-8
22A-2010-02458F
Complaint No. 10-HOU-CLE-40113

Tomeka McMillan v. Dr. W. Frederick Fromm, DDS
CLEE3(38787) 04042008
22A-2008-03500F
Complaint No. 08-EMP-CLE-38787

5. Issue Dismissal Order – Submitted by the Attorney General's Office

Beverly Gregory v. Rite-Aid, Inc.
TOLA2(32336)0709008
22A-2008-03873C
Complaint No. 09-EMP-TOL-32336

6. Issue Cease and Desist Order – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office

Kaloni M. Wheeler v. Damon’s International, dba Damon’s Grill
CLE74(39772)07282009
22A-2010-00436C
Complaint No. 10-EMP-CLE-39772

7. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office

Fair Housing Resource Center, Inc. v. Richard and Rose Bien
CLEH4(40132)01252010
05-10-0691-8
22A-2010-02459F
Complaint No. 10-HOU-CLE-40132

8. Res Judicata; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office

OCRC (Elaine Batie) v. Guardsmark, LLC
AKR73(34359)05292009
22A-2010-00025C
Complaint No. 09-EMP-AKR-34359

OCRC (Elaine Batie) v. Guardsmark, LLC
AKR73(34489)07232009
22A-2010-00249C
Complaint No. 09-EMP-AKR-34489

9. Administrative Closure; Dismiss Formal Complaint – Submitted by the Attorney General’s Office

Anthony C. Wallace v. Johnston Coca-Cola Bottling Group, Inc. d/b/a Coca Cola Enterprises
CIN705051303(30302)051903
22A-2003-02527C
Complaint No. 9625

Brenda Alexander v. Ganley Pontiac, Inc.
CLEB4121304(35750)011005
22A-2005-01237C
Complaint No. 9941

10. Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation

Jonathan A. Wicker and Natasha Ryann Holpp v. Ned G. Gibson, Erin K. Cottrill,
Jennifer L. Derwacter and Marian D. Henthorne
COLH1(40623)10232013
05-14-0077-8
22A-2014-00421F

Housing Research and Advocacy Center v. Edward C. Long, Mary A. Long
CLEH4(42044)06242013 AMENDED
05-13-1534-8
22A-2013-02563F

Housing Research and Advocacy Center v. Stephen D. Carver and Renate G. Carver
CLEH4(42047)06242013 AMENDED
05-13-1543-8
22A-2013-02565F

Frank Baltimore v. Premier Ladies Fitness*
DAY76(23573)04242013
22A-2013-02410C

*Split recommendation. Probable Cause finding on issue of Hostile Work Environment.
No Probable Cause finding on issues of Demotion and Terms and Conditions

Herbert J. Pino v. Kroger Store #812
DAYB6(23632)05222013
22A-2013-02400C

Latasha Hannah v. Charles W. Lyons; Doris A. Lyons
DAYH6(23636)05242013
05-13-1268-8
22A-2013-02531F

Dorothy White, et al. v. Becky L. Armstrong
DAYH6(23920)09252013
05-13-1477-8
22A-2014-00723F

Regina Martin v. Vincent and Mary Broerman, Owner/Landlord; Metropolitan Housing
Group, Ltd.
DAYH6(23936)10152013
05-14-0032-8
22A-2014-00675F

11. Issue Formal Complaint

Jeremy Florea v. DeCapua Enterprises, Inc. dba Dawson
COL71(40154)03262013
22A-2013-02007C

Lloyd Clark v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services*
COL71(40191)04102013
22A-2013-02200C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Willie Mathis v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services*
COL71(40192)04102013
22A-2013-02009C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Gretchen Roundtree v. Taffy Bradford, Property Manager, Daniel Pessar, Project
Manager; Tall Oaks Realty, LLC; Winterwood Management LLC; Tall Oaks Apartments
COLH1(40306) 6052013
05-13-0900-8
22A-2013-02353F

Tina M. Hull v. Best Western Premier Grand Plaza Hotel
TOLA2(35833)03272013 AMENDED
22A-2013-01791C

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. W. Y. (William) Espenschied
AKRH3(36833)04022013
05-13-1127-8
22A-2013-03108F

Laura L. Middleton v. Home Depot USA, Inc.
DAYA6(23536)04022013
22A-2013-01937C

12. Ratify Conciliation Agreement after a Finding of Probable Cause

Kayla M. Meighen v. Mark Dannemiller
AKRE3(36896)05102013
22A-2013-02143F

Samantha Jo Baus v. Mark Dannemiller
AKRE3(36898)05102013
22A-2013-02144F

13. Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination – Close

Housing Research and Advocacy Center v. Latanya Emerson
CLEH4(42046)06242013 AMENDED
05-13-1530-8
22A-2013-02564F

Cynthia O'Toole et.al. v. RJKL Properties, LLC
DAYH6(23839)07252013 *AMENDED
05 13-1142-8
22A-2014-00218F

Christian Kincaid v. Premier Management, LLC; Deb Fisher, Lillian Rose Apartments
DAYH6(24085)12242013
05-14-0334-8
22A-2014-00970F

Meriden Rae Smucker v. Owens-Illinois
ADR72(36326)12262013
22A-2014-00792C

Timothy Wright et al v. David E. and Elizabeth J. Moyer, Owners
ADRH2(36351)01162014
05-14-0400-8
22A-2014-01024F

Shirley Ater and John Shoemaker, Jr. v. Westgate Mobile Home Community, Joseph Badalamenti and Janet Justice
ADRH3(37034)08022013
05-13-1511-8
22A-2013-02948F

Andrea Johns v. Ledgewood Condominium Association Owners' Association, Inc.
ADRH3(37145)10152013
05-14-0051-8
22A-2014-00139F

Lori Gardner v. Ledgewood Condominium Association Owners' Association, Inc.
ADRH3(37146)10152013
05-14-0052-8
22A-2014-00138F

Le'Ray Gibson v. Akron Metropolitan Housing Authority, James Casey and Gerald Donnelly
ADRH3(37171)10292013
05-14-0483-8
22A-2014-00317F

**Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination –
Close - continued**

Jasmine Lesley McCail v. Kozmic Korner, Inc.
ADR73(37247)12201013
22A-2014-00814C

Justina Leann Newman v. Akron Metropolitan Housing Authority
ADRB3(37288)01302014
22A-2014-01012C

Kelly M. Beard v. Paul Bures/Milton Manor Apartments
ADRH4(42339)02062014
05-14-0541-8
22A-2014-01081F

Matthew Royer v. Salem BBQ, LLC
ADRB3(37293)02042014
22A-2014-01071C

Stacey L. McClinton v. EDEN, INC.
ADRH4(42275)12092013
05-14-0382-8
22A-2014-00624F

Sara King v. Lowe's Home Centers, LLC
ADR76(24045)12022013
22A-2014-00679C

Valerie Holly v. YURPS; Anthony Venuto, Property Manager; Leo Underhill, Owner
ADRH6(24056)12052013
05-14-0205-8
22A-2014-00641F

H.O.M.E v. YUPRS, INC.; Anthony Venuto, Property Manager
ADRH6(24059)12052013
05-14-0207-8
22A-2014-00653F

Jennifer Holly v. YUPRS, INC.; Anthony Venuto, Property Manager
ADRH6(24081)12172013
05-13-0256-8
22A-2014-00972F

Paul Swann v. PAX Corrugated Products, Inc.
ADRB6(24115)01212014
22A-2014-00965C

**Ratify Conciliation Agreement and Consent Order Prior to Final Determination –
Close - continued**

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Rachelle L. Metzger
ADRH6(24124)01242014
05-14-0437-8
22A-2014-01130F

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Cynthia M. and Donald P. Rowley, Jr.,
Owners
ADRH6(24138)01312014
05-14-0484-8
22A-2014-01139F

Miami Valley Fair Housing Center, Inc. v. Harold Gates; Gates Brothers Partnership
Investments, LLC
ADRH6(24139)01312014
22A-2014-01138F

14. Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement

Kiesha T. Garry v. Staffing Management/SMX Staffing
COL71(40362)07022013
22A-2013-03006C

Oletha Deloris Payne v. Safeware, The Insurance Agency, Inc.
COL71(40600)10212013
22A-2014-00538C

Kellie Jo Clark v. C. H. Bradshaw Co.
COL71(40629)11052013
22A-2014-00461C

James Richard Shirley v. Ohio Department of Job and Family Services
COLA1(40764)02062014
22A-2014-01252C

Karlveltis M. White v. BP Products North America Inc.
TOLB2(35951)05232013
22A-2013-02262C

Heidi Baker v. Kokosing Construction Company, Inc.
TOL72(36121)08232013
22A-2013-03127C

Timothy Colbert, Sr. v. City of Toledo, Civil Service Commission
TOLA2(36185)09232013
22A-2013-03403C

Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement – continued

Troy Manteuffel v. Bob Evans Farms, LLC*

TOL72(36280)11212013

22A-2014-00452C

*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in this case

Shatika Dickson v. Smith Property Management, LLC and Alvin and Sharon Smith

AKRH3(37183)11132013

22A-2014-00384F

Kelly Michele Duke v. Alliance Community Hospital

AKR73(37215)11262013

22A-2014-00530C

Inder Jeet Sharma v. State of Ohio, Department of Mental Health

AKRA1(40721)01022014

22A-2014-00857C

James and Kathleen Curtis v. Christine and John Krystowski

AKRH4(42245)11062013

22A-2014-00383F

Mary Dieringer v. GZK dba Arby's

DAYA6(23772)07252013

22A-2013-02919C

William J. Dieringer v. GZK dba Arby's

DAYA6(23773)07252013

22A-2013-02899C

Sheldon Gatland v. Henny Penny Corporation

DAYA6(24049)12032014

22A-2014-00680C

Richie Dawson v. Enterprise Holding

DAY76(24131)01282014

22A-2014-01214C

Lloyd Sheldon McManus, Sr. v. Belco Works, Inc.

ADRB1(40688)12052013

22A-2014-00795C

Kevin C. Timpe v. Lowe's Home Centers, LLC (Store #1614)

ADRB2(36337)01102014

22A-2014-00845C

Withdrawal of Charge with Settlement – continued

Michael A. Girard v. Mercy Medical Center, Inc.
ADRB3(37217)12032013
22A-2014-00563C

Michael Hamley v. Brunswick Auto Mart.
ADR74(42317)01162014
22A-2014-00883C

Donald A. Wegman v. Anderson Township Fire and Rescue
ADRA6(24010)11132013
22A-2014-00733C

15. Withdrawal of Charge – Grant

Kendria Dee McDaniel v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
COL71(40540)09062013
22A-2014-00110C

Kendria Dee McDaniel v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
COL71(40541)09062013
22A-2014-00169C

Kendria Dee McDaniel v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
COL71(40568)09202013
22A-2014-00134C

Kendria Dee McDaniel v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Correction
COL71(40570)09202013
22A-2014-00111C

Robert L. Gabriel III v. City of Toledo
TOL72(35860)04082013
22A-2013-01849C

Rafael G. Aponte v. C.J. Apple III, Inc. dba Applebee's
TOLB2(35863)04092013
22A-2013-01854C

Jerome Mitchell v. Vitran Express, Inc.
TOLA2(35904)05012013
22A-2013-02070C

Mary B. Lauer v. Lucas County Court of Common Pleas
TOL72(35910)05062013
22A-2013-02096C

Withdrawal of Charge – Grant – continued

Rebecca Wilson v. American Ambulette and Ambulance Service, Inc., dba MedCorp
TOLA2(35911)05062013
22A-2013-02097C

David P. Hill v. City of Findlay, Police Department
TOL72(35933)05152013
22A-2013-02157C

Robert L. Gabriel III v. City of Toledo
TOL72(36130)08262013
22A-2013-03169C

Julie Quinn-Hunt on behalf of Jayce Hunt (minor grandchild) v. Boston Market
Corporation
TOLG2(36328)12272013
22A-2014-00794F

Cathy Schultz v. Trilogy Health Service, LLC dba Valley View Healthcare Center
TOLB2(36143)09032013
22A-2013-03230C

Patricia Ann Polite v. Columbiana County Board of Developmental Disabilities, Robert
Bycroft School
AKRB3(37083)09032013
22A-2013-03286C

Anthony H. Worthen v. The General Electric Company
AKRB3(37178)11082013
22A-2014-00379C

Kaley A. Berenyi v. Aladdin's Rockside LLC dba Aladdin's Eatery
AKR73(37270)01172014
22A-2014-00950C

Kaley A. Berenyi v. Fady Chamoun
AKRE3(37276)01172014
22A-2014-00951F

Kaley A. Berenyi v. Marwan Lahham
AKRE3(37277)01172014
22A-2014-00952F

Kaley A. Berenyi v. Mario Ghosn
AKRE3(37278)01172014
22A-2014-00953F

Withdrawal of Charge – Grant – continued

Kaley A. Berenyi v. Stacy Hreha
AKRE3(37279)01172014
22A-2014-00954F

Emily K. Fatkins v. Sacred Ground Properties, LLC dba Sacred Ground Yoga
AKRG4(42128)08152013
22A-2013-03095F

Erika R. Halburnt v. Clark County Sheriff's Office
DAY76(23978)10292013
22A-2014-00912C

Kimberly A. Reid v. Miami Valley Hospital
DAY76(24126)01272014
22A-2014-01028C

16. Withdrawal of Charge – Grant –After a Finding of Probable Cause - Close

Reginald Laughlin v. City of Cleveland, Water Pollution Control
CLEB4(41987)05142013
22A-2013-02173C

17. Failure to Cooperate – Dismiss

Tricia Fincham v. Homeward Residential, Inc. and Chelise Williams
AKRH3(36865)04192013
05-13-0719-8
22A-2013-02018F

18. Administrative Closure

Tashawn Williams v. Amber Marie Tillett, Tenant
TOLH2(36369)02072014
05-14-0492-8
22A-2014-01156F

Claudia A. Bodey v. State of Ohio, Ohio Veterans Home
CLEA1(40542)09092013
22A-2014-00057C

James C. Withee v. City of Gallipolis, Police Department
DAYA6(24116)01212014
22A-2014-00961C

19. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Brandi Provoznik v. American Court Services
COL71(40186)04082013
22A-2013-02006C

Holly Ann Allen v. B.P.O.E Lodge #448
COL71(40207)04152013
22A-2013-02197C

Louann Elliott v. Holzer Clinic
COL71(40210)04152013
22A-2014-01019C

Kateryna Yergina v. Elysium Tennis Club
COL71(40217)04262013
22A-2013-02187C

Michele Tartt v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services*
COL71(40219)04292013
22A-2013-02641C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Mark Wantage v. State of Ohio, Development Services Agency, Office of Energy
COL71(40226)04292013
22A-2013-02643C

Charette J. Hollins v. State of Ohio, Department of Rehabilitation and Corrections
COL71(40230)04302013
22A-2013-02640C

Maria P. Swiger v. Scioto Downs, Inc.
COLB1(40259)05132013
22A-2013-02788C

Tessie Belue v. Big Brothers Big Sisters of Central Ohio
COL71(40262)05142013
22A-2013-02790C

Kenya L. Barrett v. The Kroger Co.
COL71(40265)05162013
22A-2013-02301C

Kathleen Tincher v. Franklin County Sheriff's Office
COLB1(40236)05022013
22A-2013-02242C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Myrissa Ferguson v. Nationwide Children's Hospital*

COL71(40251)05072013

22A-2013-02686C

*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in this case

Gatonia Cunningham v. Pathology Laboratories, Inc.-Geanie Harris, Supervisor

COLA1(40252)05082013

22A-2013-02685C

Robert M. Maeder v. Hollywood Casino

COL71(40254)05092013

22A-2013-02246C

Cherrelle Kay Harris v. Ocedon Resturant Group, LLC dba Burger King

COL71(40256)05102013

22A-2013-02680C

Gatonia Cunningham v. Geanie Harris, Supervisor

COLE1(40267)05202013

22A-2013-02503F

Bryce R. Burnett v. Kroger

COL71(40271)05212013

22A-2013-02498C

Katrina Nelson v. Nibbles Corner Café, Inc. dba Nibbles Coffee Shop

COL71(40272)05212013

22A-2013-02477C

Lisa Crawley-McGhee v. CompDrug, Inc.

COLA1(40276)05232013

22A-2013-02491C

Alvin Holloman v. Huntington National Bank*

COL71(40292)06032013

22A-2013-02805C

*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in this case

Tamara Brooks v. National Vision, Inc. dba America's Best

COLA1(40347)06142013

22A-2013-02802C

Kimberly N. Allen-Davis v. Liberty Community Center

COLA1(40422)07252013

22A-2013-03449C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Phyllis L. Granger v. Children First
COL71(40601)10212013
22A-2014-00535C

Dorothy Spurlock v. The University of Toledo
TOLB2(35900)04292013 AMENDED
22A-2013-02046C

Renecia M. Stanley v. American Red Cross
TOL72(35901)04302013
22A-2013-02067C

Becky Winsted v. Riverview Yacht Club, Inc.
TOLE2(35917)05082013
22A-2013-02124F

Debra L. Hernandez v. Fulton Industries, Inc.
TOL72(35913)05072013
22A-2013-02108C

Alisha Christoff et al v. Richard Read Schalmo and Elizabeth Schalmo; Richard R.
Schalmo et al
TOLH2(35914)05072013
05-13-0791-8
22A-2013-02115F

David D. Copeland v. Central Auto Finance, Inc.
TOLG2(35919)05082013
22A-2013-02126F

Maryanne Cook v. Andy Frain Services, Inc.
TOLA2(35927)05102013
22A-2013-02146C

Amanda N. Sattler v. E. M. I. Enterprises, Inc. d/b/a Envelope Mart USA
TOL72(35935)05152013
22A-2013-02174C

Sharmiane R. Haynes v. Morrison Management Specialists, Inc.
TOL72(35936)05152013
22A-2013-02176C

Debbie I. Hooker v. Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. *
TOL72(35937)05162013
22A-2013-02182C

*Commissioner Barreras recused herself from participation in the case

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Lacy Phlegar III v. RMF Nooter, Inc.
TOLB2(35940)05202013
22A-2013-02215C

Lerline C. Brassfield v. Lucas County Board of Elections
TOLA2(35945)05222013
22A-2013-02229C

Reshonda Boyd v. The Kroger Co.
TOL72(35959)05312013
22A-2013-02285C

Joyce A. Reese v. The University of Toledo
TOLB2(35983)06142013
22A-2013-02444C

Eugene Ziolkowski v. Sears, Roebuck and Co.
TOLA2(36073)07302013
22A-2013-02877C

Margaret M. Schotter v. Sears, Roebuck and Co.
TOLA2(36074)07302013
22A-2013-02878C

Joyce A. Reese v. The University of Toledo
TOLB2(36183)09232013
22A-2013-03401C

Adam Smith v. Goodwill Industries of Northwest Ohio, Inc.
TOLB2(36230)10242013
22A-2014-00240C

Sarah Cooper et al v. Open Arms Domestic Violence and Rape Crisis Services et al;
Council on Domestic Violence, Inc.; Kari Kessler, Employee; Yvette Mains, Employee
TOLH2(36307)12112013
05-14-0376-8
22A-2014-00615F

Victwan Dorsey and Janisha Gibson v. Doug and Cathy Bucy
AKRH3(36946)06072013
05-14-0483-8
22A-2013-02386F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Marvin Parmis v. First Federal Bank, Nick Kays and Stephen Nagy, and Clarence Zugeiter
AKRH3(36956)06062013
05-13-0977-8
22A-2013-02432F

Marvin Parmis v. Mercury Appraisal Group, Inc., Stephen Nagy and ValuTrust Solutions, LLC, and Sean Pyle, COO
AKRH3(36957)06062013
05-13-0978-8
22A-2013-02433F

Irrainia Sutton v. Arbor Home Health Care, Inc.
AKR73(36984)06282013
22A-2013-02600C

Sharon Skidmore v. County of Summit Board of Developmental Disabilities
AKR73(36990)07052013
22A-2013-02624C

Susan M. Jennings v. Apple, Inc.
AKRB3(36991)07052013
22A-2013-02627C

Stachia Lawson v. Atrium Centers Management, LLC
AKR73(36999)07122013
22A-2013-02692C

Sarita Tucker v. Odyssey Health Systems, LLC
AKR73(37006)07182013
22A-2013-02762C

James G. Moore v. Gateway Healthcare Services, LLC
AKRB3(37014)07242013
22A-2013-02852C

Darnell Beasley v. Marc Glassman, Inc.
AKR73(37035)08022013
22A-2013-02931C

Angela J. Giltner v. Anazao Community Partners dba Your Human Resource Center
AKRA3(37050)08122013
22A-2013-03025C

John Badger v. Congress Township
AKRE3(37064)08222013
22A-2013-03125F

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Bernard Roberts v. Greenstar Ohio, LLC dba Waste Management
AKRA3(37266)01152014
22A-2014-00871C

Juanita Elaine Smith v. Cerco I, Inc. dba Cerco Diamonite Plant
AKRB1(40502)08262013
22A-2013-03214C

Antonio Williamson v. Zaremba Management Co., Bridlewood Apartments, LLC, and
Jennifer Leinweber
CLEH4(41964)04232013
05-13-0731-8
22A-2013-02074F

Keisha L. Jackson v. Apple American Group, LLC
CLE74(42023)06062013
22A-2013-02391C

Sally Smith v. Joanna Lui, South Westerly Apartments, Millennia Housing Management,
Ltd., and South-Westerly Associates, LTD.
CLEH4(42041)06192013 AMENDED
05-13-0939-8
22A-2013-02561F

Housing Research and Advocacy Center v. Joanna Lui, South Westerly Apartments,
Millennia Housing Management, Ltd., and South-Westerly Associates, LTD.
CLEH4(42042)06192013 AMENDED
05-13-0938-8
22A-2013-02562F

Housing Research and Advocacy Center v. Ahab Barhouma and Marie Y. Barhouma
CLEH4(42050)06242013 AMENDED
05-13-1531-8
22A-2013-02567F

Eugene J. Williams v. Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
CLE74(42090)07192013
22A-2013-02836C

Roberto Diaz v. DMR Automotive Services, Inc. dba Almira Tire Center
CLE74(42106)08012013
22A-2013-02961C

Rashad Jamal Mason v. Snap-Rite Manufacturing, Inc.
CLE74(42122)08092013
22A-2013-03045C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

James A. Ellison v. Donley Ford-Lincoln, Inc.
CLEB4(42240)10312013
22A-2014-00314C

Monika E. Henderson v. Hitchcock Center for Women, Inc.
CLE74(42253)11142013
22A-2014-00471C

Cornell R. Curlee v. King Nut Company
CLE74(42270)12022013
22A-2014-00554C

Patricia K. Robertson v. State of Ohio, Lottery Commission
CLEA4(42273)12052013
22A-2014-00584C

Patrice L. Gibson v. Willo Security, Inc.
CLE74(42299)12202013
22A-2014-00789C

Frank Baltimore v. Premier Ladies Fitness*
DAY76(23573)04242013
22A-2013-02410C

*Split recommendation. Probable Cause finding on issue of Hostile Work Environment.
No Probable Cause finding on issues of Demotion and Terms and Conditions

Alonza C. Luster v. Golden Living Center
DAY76(23633)05222013
22A-2013-02783C

Dan Carey v. Lipo Technologies, Inc.
DAY76(23668)06122013
22A-2013-02871C

Anthony Favors v. Economy Linen
DAY76(23814)08202013
22A-2013-03155C

Efrem Dorian Brown, Jr. v. Tim Horton's USA, Inc.
DAY76(23816)08202013
22A-2013-03464C

Tony E. Johnson v. Walgreens Co.
DAYA6(23819)08022013
22A-2014-00237C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Martha McAdams v. Ford Motor Company
DAY76(23864)09172013
22A-2014-00162C

Cheryl Holland v. Ford Motor Company
DAY76(23865)09172013
22A-2014-00164C

Emily Owens v. William Armstrong, Owner
DAYH6(23877)09232013
05-13-1465-8
22A-2014-00915F

Karl L. Leath v. Staffmark, Inc.
DAY76(23934)10152013
22A-2014-01182C

Andrea Wilson v. Evergreen Southwest Behavioral Services dba Bridgewell Hospital
DAY76(23940)10162013
22A-2014-00362C

Victoria J. Gundrum v. Specialized Pharmaceuticals Inc. /QoL Meds
DAYA6(23947)10212013
22A-2014-00367C

Sylvester Woods v. Talbert House
DAYB6(23968)10232013
22A-2014-00361C

Dorothy N. Johnson v. Wendy's Old Fashioned Hamburgers of New York
DAY76(23993)11042013
22A-2014-00344C

Kevin L. Jones v. Rumpke Transportation Company LLC
DAY76(24011)11132013
22A-2014-00718C

Lori Hauser v. Hamilton County Adult Probation
DAYA6(24019)11182013
22A-2014-00411C

Dena Carpenter v. Marjorie P. Lee Retirement Community
DAYA6(24035)11252013
22A-2014-00505C

No Probable Cause – Dismiss – continued

Alexander Harrison v. Starbucks Corporation dba Starbucks Coffee Company
DAY76(24036)11262013
22A-2014-00529C

Nelia V. Sheets v. Goodwill Industries of Southern Ohio, Inc.
DAY76(24071)12162013
22A-2014-00650C

Delbert P. Perry v. Franklin University
DAYK1(40277)05282013
22A-2013-02492C

Cari Ann Cogar v. William Cargile Construction, Inc. II
DAYE1(40504)08262013
22A-2014-00223F

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to approve the March 13, 2014 Confirmation Agenda with the noted recusals. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Mercado	YES
Commissioner Roberts	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES

Motion carried.

STAFF BRIEFING

The Compliance Manager informed the Commissioners that the Commission is in compliance regarding notification requirements as set forth in Ohio Administrative Code Section 4112-1-04.

The Compliance Department, with the Executive Director's approval, requested the following case be deleted from the March 13, 2014 agenda:

Week 1, Page 2, Item I-A

Findings Upon Reconsideration

A. No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Gary Turnington v. Apex Tool Group, LLC
DAY A6(23800)08122013
22A-2013-03149C

The Charging Party's attorney requests the appearance be rescheduled for April 3, 2014. He was recently retained by Charging Party and asks for time to review the file.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to approve the Compliance Department's request to delete the foregoing case from the Commissioner's Agenda, Week 1, Page 2. Second by Commissioner Mercado.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Mercado	YES
Commissioner Roberts	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES

Motion carried.

APPEARANCES

1. Recommendation: Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Magaly Retamar-Lopez v. State of Ohio, Adjutant General's Dept.
COL71(40151)03262013
22A-2013-03073C

Upon review of the Charging Party's request for reconsideration, Aman Mehra, Columbus Regional Director, recommended the Commission deny Charging Party's request and uphold the Regional finding of No Probable Cause - Dismiss. Mr. Mehra, Regional Supervisor Angel Stone, Investigator Chris Harris, Charging Party's counsel and Respondent's counsel were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to uphold the Regional recommendation of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Second by Commissioner Barreras.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to take a brief recess. Second by Commissioner Patmon.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to return to public session. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried

2. Recommendation: Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Aristides Jurado v. A. S. LeClair Company, Inc. dba Brooksedge
Day Care Center-Hilliard
COLG1(40390)07102013
22A-2013-02731F

Upon review of the Charging Party's request for reconsideration, Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended the Commission deny Charging Party's request and uphold the Regional finding of No Probable Cause - Dismiss. Mr. Dunn, Charging Party, Respondent and Respondent's counsel were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to uphold the Regional recommendation of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

3. Recommendation: Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause - Dismiss

Aristides Jurado v. A. S. LeClair Company, Inc. dba Brooksedge
Day Care Center-Hilliard
COLG1(40639)11072013
22A-2014-00549F

Upon review of the Charging Party’s request for reconsideration, Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended the Commission deny Charging Party’s request and uphold the Regional finding of No Probable Cause - Dismiss. Mr. Dunn, Charging Party, Respondent and Respondent’s counsel were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to uphold the Regional recommendation of No Probable Cause – Dismiss. Second by Commissioner Mercado.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Patmon to recess for lunch. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to return to public session. Second by Commissioner Mercado.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried

- 4. Recommendation: Upon Reconsideration – Reverse No Probable Cause to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation regarding issue of Failure to Accommodate; Uphold No Probable Cause – Dismiss regarding issue of eviction.**

Fair Housing Advocates Association v. Harry Gongloff and
Gongloff Properties, Inc.
CLEH4(41945)04082013 AMENDED
22A-2013-03112F

Upon review of the Charging Party’s request for reconsideration, Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended the Commission Reverse the No Probable Cause finding and Schedule Conciliation on the issue of Failure to Accommodate and Uphold the No Probable Cause – Dismiss finding on the issue of Eviction. Mr. Dunn, Charging Party, Respondent and Respondent’s counsel were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to Remand the case back to the Regional office to obtain signed affidavits from witnesses Terrance Williams (granddaughter of tenant Barbara Moody), Mark Whaley (exterminator hired by Mr. Gongloff) and the housing inspector from Lorain Metropolitan Housing Authority. The parties may choose to appear before the Commissioners at the April 3, 2013 Commission Meeting in lieu of providing affidavits. Second by Commissioner Patmon.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

5. Recommendation: Upon Reconsideration – Reverse No Probable Cause to Probable Cause – Schedule Conciliation regarding issue of Failure to Accommodate; Uphold No Probable Cause – Dismiss regarding issue of eviction.

Barbara Moody v. Harry Gongloff and Gongloff Properties, Inc.
CLEH4(41962)04252013 AMENDED
05-13-0994-8
22A-2013-02053F

Upon review of the Charging Party’s request for reconsideration, Bradley Dunn, Reconsideration Supervisor, recommended the Commission Reverse the No Probable Cause finding and Schedule Conciliation on the issue of Failure to Accommodate and Uphold the No Probable Cause – Dismiss finding on the issue of Eviction. Mr. Dunn, Charging Party, Charging Party’s counsel, Respondent and Respondent’s counsel were present to discuss the case.

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to Remand the case back to the Regional office to obtain signed affidavits from witnesses Terrance Williams (granddaughter of tenant Barbara Moody), Mark Whaley (exterminator hired by Mr. Gongloff) and the housing inspector from Lorain Metropolitan Housing Authority. The parties may choose to appear before the Commissioners at the April 3, 2013 Commission Meeting in lieu of providing affidavits. Second by Commissioner Patmon.

Roll Call Vote:

Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Lori Barreras	YES
Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES

Motion carried.

COMMISSIONER AGENDA

Agenda for Week 1

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Sarah Parker-Allen v. City of Columbus, Division of Public Service
COLB1(40123)03202013
22A-2013-03062C

Dedra Stephens v. Nurtur, LLC dba The Aveda Institute Columbus
COLK1(40178)04052013
22A-2013-02027F

Portia Sue Lewis v. CCA Tennessee LLC dba Lake Erie Correctional Institution
AKRB4(41968)04302013
22A-2013-02078C

Kimberly Sue Kessler v. CCA Tennessee LLC dba Lake Erie Correctional Institution
AKA74(41976)05012013
22A-2013-02088C

Mitchell Moss v. Thistledown Racetrack, LLC
CLEG3(36949)06102013
22A-2013-02475F

Otto O. Bouttakoth v. Cast-Fab Technologies, Inc
DAYB6(23539)04052013
22A-2013-02037C

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Week 1 Agenda. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES

Motion carried.

Agenda for Week 2

1. Findings Upon Reconsideration – No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Jessi Chapman v. Appraisal Asset, LLC
COLH1(40342)06202013
05-13-0963-8
22A-2013-02510F

Jessi Chapman v. Exit Realty Leaders and Trinita Real Estate Group Hilliard,
LLC dba Exit Kleos Associates Realty
COLH1(40343)06202013
05-13-0954-8
22A-2013-02511F

John Harman v. Khushali Swapnil Inc. dba Mr. Hero
AKRG3(36909)05152013
22A-2013-02186F

Kwyelund Becton v. Thistledown Racetrack, LLC
CLEG3(36948)06102013
22A-2013-02474F

Arthur James McCurdy, Jr. v. The Kroger Co.
DAYG(23710)06262013
22A-2013-03021F

Jerome Jackson v. AFSCME Ohio Council 8, Local 217
DAYB6(23963)10232013
22A-2014-00716C

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to adopt the staff findings in the foregoing captioned cases on the Week 2 Agenda. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES

Motion carried.

Agenda for Week 3

1. Requests for Reconsideration - Respondent's Request – Deny

Lloyd Clark v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family*
Services

COL71(40191)04102013

22A-2013-02200C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Willie Mathis v. State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family*
Services

COL71(40192)04102013

22A-2013-02009C

*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Tina M. Hull v. Best Western Premier Grand Plaza Hotel

TOLA2(35833)03272013 AMENDED

22A-2013-01791C

Laura L. Middleton v. The Home Depot

DAYA6(23536)04022013

22A-2013-01937C

2. Findings Upon Reconsideration –

No Probable Cause – Dismiss

Aristides Jurado v. A. S. LeClair Company, Inc. dba Brooksedge
Day Care Center-Hillard

COLG1(40639)11072013

22A-2014-00549F

No Jurisdiction – Dismiss

Fred and Ruth Quigley v. Macedonia Property Management, LLC,
Coblentz Homes, Inc., Joseph Migliorini, Chris Coblentz, and
Linda Carruci

AKRH3(36858)04192013

22A-2013-02003F

Agenda for Week 3 – continued

3. No Jurisdiction – Dismiss

Christina D. Hoffman v. Trumbull County Department of Job and Family Services; State of Ohio, Department of Job and Family Services*
CLE73(37013)07242013
22A-2013-02851C
*Commissioner Patmon recused himself from participation in this case

Edward Thompson v. Edgewater Post No. 387 of the Veterans of Foreign Wars of the United States
CLEE4(42065)07082013
22A-2013-02706F

Jeffrey Dailey v. United States Department of Veterans Affairs
DAY76(24170)02122014
22A-2014-01324C

4. Consideration of Administrative Law Judge's Report and Recommendation

Administrative Law Judge Recommends Cease and Desist Order

Heather Ingram v. Feta Greek Kuzina, LLC
COL71(38510)04072011
22A-2012-00887C
Complaint No. 12-EMP-COL-38510

Kaci Taylor v. New Option Adult Day Services, Inc. dba New Option Dayhab
DAY76(21779)10222010
22A-2011-00984C
Complaint No. 11-EMP-DAY-21779

5. Consideration of Administrative Law Judge's Report and Recommendation; Respondent's Objections; Attorney General's Response Thereto

Administrative Law Judge Recommends Cease and Desist Order

Paulette R. Neer v. Feet First, Inc.
DAYE6(17651)03022006
22A-2006-19657F
Complaint No. 06-EMP-DAY-17651

MOTION by Commissioner Roberts to adopt the staff finding in the foregoing captioned case on the Week 3 Agenda with the noted recusals. Second by Commissioner Mercado.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES

Motion carried.

REPORT FROM THE ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE

Lori Anthony, Chief, Civil Rights Section – Ohio Attorney General's Office presented an update on civil rights cases in the national spotlight.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director Payton read a letter he received from the Montgomery County Juvenile Court praising the work of Toledo Regional Director Darlene Newbern who recently spoke to their group.

Director Payton introduced the three new investigators who were attending the meeting as part of their orientation program. Chip Neilson is a recent graduate of the University of Dayton School of Law and was an extern in our Dayton regional office. Christine Hodge is returning to the Columbus regional office from the Department of Development. Ta'Meka Brooks joined the OCRC as Akron's Team Coordinator and was recently promoted to investigator. We are pleased to have them as part of our OCRC family.

CHIEF LEGAL COUNSEL'S REPORT

Stephanie Bostos Demers, Chief Legal Counsel provided an update on the pending legislation of House Bill 333.

REMARKS

Commissioner Tom Roberts expressed his thanks for our help in welcoming members of the state chapter of the NAACP participating in their annual Lobby Day at the General Assembly.

Commissioner Stephanie Mercado recently met with the dean of the Cleveland-Marshall College of Law and they shared their commitment to work together advancing issues important to the university and OCRC.

Commissioner Lori Barreras is serving on the Greater Columbus Infant Mortality Task Force and reported on some of their recent findings related to health and wellness issues affecting Ohioans and our minority communities.

Chairman Leonard Hubert met with the new president of Dennison University, Adam Weinberg. President Weinberg expressed interest in the university hosting an Ohio Civil Rights Commission meeting in the near future.

MOTION by Commissioner Mercado to adjourn the public meeting. Second by Commissioner Roberts.

Roll Call Vote:

Chairman Leonard Hubert	YES
Commissioner Tom Roberts	YES
Commissioner Stephanie Mercado	YES
Commissioner William Patmon	YES
Commissioner Barreras	YES

Motion carried.

The regular meeting of The Ohio Civil Rights Commission was ADJOURNED at 2:40 pm.

 ***

Commissioner